Separation of Powers Law

Cases and Materials

FOURTH EDITION

Peter M. Shane
JACOB E. DAVIS AND JACOB E. DAVIS II CHAIR IN LAW
THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY MORITZ COLLEGE OF LAW

Harold H. Bruff
ROSENBAUM PROFESSOR OF LAW EMERITUS AND DEAN EMERITUS
UNIVERSITY OF COLORADO LAW SCHOOL

Neil J. Kinkopf
PROFESSOR OF LAW
GEORGIA STATE UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF LAW

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina
# Contents

Table of Cases  xix

Preface  xxix

Chapter 1 · Introduction  3
A. Constitutional History  3
   1. Atlantic Legacy  4
   2. Government in Colonial America  5
   3. Revolutionary State Governments  6
   4. The Articles of Confederation  8
   5. The Constitutional Convention  9
   6. Expounding and Ratifying the Constitution  12
B. Approaches to Separation of Powers Analysis  14
   1. Textual  14
   2. Original Intent  15
   3. Structural/Functional  16
   4. Institutional Competence  17
   5. Historical Practice  17
   6. Values  17
C. The Ambiguities of Executive Power: Competing Theories of the Presidency  18
   1. Washington  19
   2. Jefferson  21
   3. Jackson  22
   4. Buchanan  23
   5. Lincoln  24
   6. Wilson on the Post-Civil War Presidency  25
   7. Theodore Roosevelt and Taft  25
   8. Franklin Roosevelt  27
   9. Truman through Carter  28
  11. Clinton  30
  12. George W. Bush  30
  13. Obama  31
  14. Trump  31
### CONTENTS

D. An Institutional Overview
   1. Congress 33
   2. The Executive 35
   3. The Judiciary 40

Chapter 2 · Framework: The Separation and Confluence of Powers 43

A. Analytic Framework: The Rule of Law and the Realm of Politics 43
   1. The Executive and the Judiciary 43
      - *Marbury v. Madison* 46
      - Note on Obtaining Judicial Review of Executive Actions 56
   2. The Executive and Congress (as Mediated by the Courts) 60
      - Introductory Note on Executive Orders 64
      - *United States v. Midwest Oil Co.* 65
      - *Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer* 73
      - Note on Private Enforcement of Executive Orders 95
   3. Congress and the Judiciary: Statutory Control of Federal Jurisdiction 97
      - *Ex Parte McCardle* 100
      - *United States v. Klein* 102
   4. Judicial Self-Restraint 107

B. Combining Powers in the Executive 115
   1. Delegation of Legislative Powers 116
      - Note: Finding an “Intelligible Principle” in Vague Statutory Text 126
   2. Allocating Adjudicative Power Outside the Judiciary 131

C. Fundamental Checks and Balances 139
   1. Veto Powers 140
      a. The President’s Veto 140
      - Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments and Agencies On Presidential Signing Statements 151
      b. Pocket Vetoes 153
      c. “Legislative Vetoes” 157
      - *Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Chadha* 159
   2. Congress’s “Power of the Purse” 178
      a. Overview of Budget and Spending Processes 178
      b. Congressional Control of Spending 184
      - *Brown v. Califano* 188
      c. Executive Control of Spending 193
      - *Lincoln v. Vigil* 195
      - Note on Impoundment of Funds 197
      d. The Item Veto 202
      - *Clinton v. City of New York* 202
   3. Amending the Constitution 215
      - *Coleman v. Miller* 217
Chapter 3 · Autonomy and Mutual Accountability among the Branches 225

A. Congressional Power over the Membership of the Branches 225
   1. Impeachment 225
      a. “High Crimes and Misdemeanors” 225
         Constitutional Grounds for Presidential Impeachment 227
         Impeachment of Richard M. Nixon, President of the United States 233
         Trial Memorandum of the United States House of Representatives 241
         Answer of President William Jefferson Clinton to the Articles of Impeachment 245
      b. A Judicial Role? 254
         Nixon v. United States 254
   2. Membership in Congress 261
      a. Exclusion and Expulsion 261
         Powell v. McCormack 261
      b. Term Limits 267

B. Immunities of Government Officers 268
   1. Congressional Immunity 268
      Gravel v. United States 270
   2. Immunities of Executive Officers from Civil Liability 279
      a. The President 279
         Nixon v. Fitzgerald 279
         Clinton v. Jones 289
      b. Other Executive Officers 300
         Harlow & Butterfield v. Fitzgerald 300
         Mitchell v. Forsyth 306
   3. Judicial Immunities 311

C. Information and Accountability 312
   1. Confidentiality in Congress and the Judiciary 312
   2. Executive Privilege 314
      a. Courts v. The Executive 315
         United States v. Nixon 315
         The State Secrets Privilege 329
         Mohamed v. Jeppesen Dataplan, Inc. 330
      b. Congress v. The Executive 354
         1.) Executive Branch Procedure for Invoking Executive Privilege 357
            Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments and Agencies 357
         2.) A Constitutional Requirement of Compromise? 359
         3.) Litigating Executive Responses to Congressional Subpoenas 361
Committee on the Judiciary, U.S. House of Representatives v. Miers 361

D. Congressional Power to Regulate Accountability 385
   1. Regulating the Executive 385
      a. Control of Presidential Documents 385
         Nixon v. Administrator of General Services 385
      b. The Administrative Procedure Act 392
      c. Freedom of Information Act 400
         Kissinger v. Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press 400
      d. Federal Advisory Committee Act 405
         Ass’n of American Physicians and Surgeons v. Clinton 407
         Cheney v. United States District Court for the District of Columbia 414
      e. Other Statutory Restrictions 422
      f. Subjecting Presidential Advisers to Advice and Consent 423
         g. The Foreign Emoluments Clause 429
   2. Regulating the Judiciary 431
      Mistretta v. United States 431
   3. Congressional Self-Regulation 437

Chapter 4  Control of Administration by the Elected Branches 443

A. Personnel 443
   1. The Appointments Clause 443
      Buckley v. Valeo 443
   2. Alternatives to the Appointments Clause 454
      National Labor Relations Bd. v. Noel Canning 457
   3. Appointment of Judges 469
      a. Appointments to the Supreme Court 470
      Note on Supreme Court Appointments 470
      The Coming Crisis in Recovery and What Can Be Done About It 477
      Reorganization of the Federal Judiciary 480
      b. Appointments to the Courts of Appeals and District Courts 482
      c. Recess Appointments of Judges 484
   4. Removals (Herein of Independent Agencies) 488
      a. Separation of Powers 488
         Myers v. United States 490
         Humphrey’s Executor v. United States 499
         Bowsher v. Synar 505
   B. Modern Syntheses of Appointment and Removal Powers 518
      Morrison v. Olson 518
      Free Enterprise Fund v. Public Company Accounting Oversight Board 541
   C. Supervision and Coordination of Policymaking 564
CONTENTS

1. The President’s Power to Manage Administration 564
   a. Formative Years: Groping for Principles 564
   The Jewels of the Princess of Orange 565
   b. The President’s Statutory Powers to Manage the
      Executive Branch 571
c. Participation in Administrative Rulemaking 572
   Sierra Club v. Costle 572
   d. Coordinating the Regulatory Process 582
      Regulatory Organization 584
      Memorandum for Honorable David Stockman, Director,
      Office of Management and Budget 592
      Note: Post-Reagan Presidential Regulatory Oversight 596
2. Congressional Oversight 599
3. A Unitary or Plural Executive? The Special Status of the
   Independent Agencies Revisited 604
D. The Faithful Execution of the Laws 611
   1. Faithful Execution: Duty or Authority? 611
   2. Faithful Nonexecution? 614
      a. Unconstitutional Statutes 615
         Presidential Authority to Decline to Execute
         Unconstitutional Statutes 617
      b. Nonexecution and Administrative Discretion 620
         Faithful Nonexecution 620
         Case Study: Obama Administration Deferred Action
         Policies for Undocumented Immigrants 635
         The Department of Homeland Security’s Authority to
         Prioritize Removal of Certain Aliens Unlawfully Present
         in the United States and to Defer Removal of Others 638
      c. Prosecutorial Discretion and Criminal Law Enforcement 664
         Prosecution for Contempt of Congress of an Executive Branch
         Official Who Has Asserted a Claim of Executive Privilege 664
   3. Faithful Execution and the Courts 677
      a. A Duty to Defend Congress? 677
         Representation of Congress and Congressional Interests
         in Court 678
         Letter from Attorney General Eric H. Holder to Congress
         on Litigation Involving the Defense of Marriage Act 681
         Note: Raines v. Byrd and Congressional Standing 687
      b. The Conduct of Civil Litigation 690
      c. Obedience to Judgments 695
   4. Pardons and Reprieves 698

Chapter 5 · Foreign Policy and National Security 709
   A. Analytic Framework: Sorting the Elected Branches’ Claims to Power 710
CONTENTS

Letters of Pacificus, No. I (A. Hamilton) 711
Note: The History of Foreign Affairs and National Security Powers 717
United States v. Curtiss-Wright Corp. 723
Note: The Logan Act and the Federal Government’s Monopoly in Foreign Policy 732
Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer 734
Zivotofsky v. Kerry 735
Note: Statutory Interpretation in the Context of the President’s Foreign Policy and National Security Powers 747

B. Executive Claims to Inherent and Exclusive Powers 748
1. The President’s Power of Recognition and Role as “Sole Organ” of Foreign Affairs 748
Bill to Relocate United States Embassy from Tel Aviv to Jerusalem 749
Constitutionality of Section 7054 of the Fiscal Year 2009 Foreign Appropriations Act 752

2. Treaty Processes 758
a. Overview of Treaty Powers 758
b. Presidential Treaty Implementation
   Medellín v. Texas 766
c. Presidential Treaty Termination
   Goldwater v. Carter 779

2. Executive Agreements 785
   Note: International Non-Treaty Agreements 785
   Memorandum Opinion for the United States Trade Representative: Whether Uruguay Round Agreements Required Ratification as a Treaty 786
   United States v. Pink 794
   Dames & Moore v. Regan 803
   Note: The Iran Nuclear Agreement of 2015 820

3. Control of Sensitive Information 823
   New York Times Co. v. United States 825
   Problem: Applying New York Times After September 11 838
   Note on Classification and Protection of Government Documents 840

4. Power to Conduct Investigations (Herein, of Foreign Intelligence Surveillance) 845
   a. Electronic Surveillance, Executive Power, and the Fourth Amendment Prior to FISA 845
      Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act of 1977 846
      United States v. United States District Court (Keith) 848
   b. The Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act, 1978–2001 856

C. Congress’s Role in Regulating Foreign Policy 864
CONTENTS

1. Direct Regulation of Foreign Affairs and National Security Policy 864
   a. Presidential and Congressional Oversight of CIA and
      FBI Intelligence Gathering 864
      Samuel J. Rascoff, Domesticating Intelligence 872
   b. The Iran-Contra Affair 885
   c. Iran-Contra and Congressional Oversight of
      Covert Operations 893
      Title 50, Chapter One — National Security Subchapter III —
      Accountability for Intelligence Activities 894

2. Foreign Policy and Foreign Commerce 904
   b. Trade Expansion Act 906
      Independent Gasoline Marketers Council v. Duncan 906

3. Immigration and Foreign Policy 911
   United States ex rel. Knauff v. Shaughnessy 912
   Note: The Trump Executive Orders on Immigration 916

4. Regulatory Programs Affecting Foreign Policy 925
   Westinghouse Electric Corp. v. U.S. Nuclear Regulatory
   Commission 925

D. Judicial Review and Foreign Policy 932
   Haig v. Agee 934

Chapter 6 · War Powers 951
   A. Power to Commit Troops — From the Founding to Vietnam 953
      1. Scope of the Commander in Chief Clause: Early Views 953
         The Federalist, No. 69 (Hamilton) 953
         Little v. Barreme 954
         The Prize Cases 956
         Note: The 2001 Authorization to Use Military Force 966
      2. The Vietnam Watershed 966
         a. Debating Executive Claims to Power 967
            Meeker, The Legality of United States Participation in
            the Defense of Viet-Nam 967
            National Commitments 973
            Notes and Questions on Vietnam 989
         b. Congress’s Efforts to Limit the President’s Authority to
            Commit Troops: The War Powers Resolution 992
            War Powers Resolution 992
            President Nixon’s Veto of the War Powers Resolution 995
            War Powers: A Test of Compliance — Relative to the Danang
            Sealift, the Evacuation of Phnom Penh, the Evacuation
            of Saigon, and the Mayaguez Incident 998
            Explanation by Senator Jacob Javits of the Conference Report 999
            Questions on the War Powers Resolution 999
B. Unilateral Presidential Initiative After the War Powers Resolution

1. Presidential War-making in the Post-Vietnam Era
   a. Rescuing Americans
      President Carter’s Report to Speaker O’Neill Concerning the Abortive Rescue Attempt in Iran
      Legal Opinion by Lloyd Cutler, President’s Counsel, on War Powers Consultation Relative to the Iran Rescue Mission (May 9, 1980)
   b. Stabilizing Other Governments in Furtherance of American Foreign Policy
   c. Retaliation for Attacks on United States Persons
   d. Protecting U.S. Persons and Property
   e. Humanitarian Intervention
   f. Antiterrorism Operations
   g. International Peacekeeping
      Memorandum for the Attorney General Re: Authorization for Continuing Hostilities in Kosovo
      Case Study: The Libya No-Fly Zone
      Harold Hongju Koh, U.S. Department of State, Washington, D.C.

2. Judicial Review of Presidential War-Making
   Mora v. McNamara
   Campbell v. Clinton

3. Reform of the War Powers Resolution
   Robert F. Grimmett, The War Powers Resolution: After Thirty-Six Years

C. Congressionally Authorized Wars After Vietnam: The Persian Gulf and Iraq Wars

1. The Persian Gulf War: A New Watershed?
   a. Managing the Crisis Under Presidential Authority Alone
      Letter to the Speaker of the House and the President Pro Tempore of the Senate on the Deployment of United States Armed Forces to Saudi Arabia and the Middle East
      Letter to the Speaker of the House and the President Pro Tempore of the Senate on Additional Economic Measures Taken with Respect to Iraq and Kuwait
   b. The United Nations Authorizes Force
      United Nations Security Council Resolution 678
      Authorization for Use of Military Force Against Iraq Resolution
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Statement on Signing the Resolution Authorizing the Use of Military Force Against Iraq</td>
<td>1083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Iraq Invasion of 2003</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. From the Persian Gulf War to the 2003 Invasion</td>
<td>1087</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Constitutional War Powers and International Law</td>
<td>1091</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Ackerman, International Law and the Preemptive Use of Force Against Iraq</td>
<td>1091</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Ellen O’Connell, UN Resolution 1441: Compelling Saddam, Restraining Bush</td>
<td>1092</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The Necessity and Scope of Congressional Authorization</td>
<td>1096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authorization for Use of Military Force Against Iraq Resolution of 2002</td>
<td>1096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doe v. Bush</td>
<td>1101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Interbranch Accountability for Preemptive War-Making and the Separation of Powers</td>
<td>1110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note: Congressional Authority to Regulate How the President Makes War</td>
<td>1118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scholars’ Letter to Congressional Leaders on the Proposed Iraq Troop Surge</td>
<td>1119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Presidential Wartime Powers Off the Battlefield</td>
<td>1123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Civil Liberties</td>
<td>1123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ex Parte Milligan</td>
<td>1125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korematsu v. United States</td>
<td>1132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions on Japanese Internment and Its Aftermath</td>
<td>1147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Mobilization and Regulation of the Economy</td>
<td>1151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note: Presidential Economic Controls During World War II</td>
<td>1151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Powers of the President under the War Labor Disputes Act to Seize Properties Affected by Strikes</td>
<td>1155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7 · The “Long War” and the Separation of Powers</td>
<td>1159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Wartime Powers During the “War” on Terror</td>
<td>1160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Treatment of Enemy Combatants</td>
<td>1160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen J. Shapiro, et al., Report of the Bar of the City of New York</td>
<td>1161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notice, Detention Treatment, and Trial of Certain Non-Citizens in the War Against Terrorism</td>
<td>1161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamdi v. Rumsfeld</td>
<td>1168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harold H. Bruff, Bad Advice: Bush’s Lawyers in the War on Terror</td>
<td>1195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamdan v. Rumsfeld</td>
<td>1204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boumediene v. Bush</td>
<td>1221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions on the Guantanamo Detainee Cases</td>
<td>1237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note: Government Lawyering, September 11 and the Iraq War</td>
<td>1250</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Harold H. Bruff, Bad Advice: Bush’s Lawyers in the War on Terror 1252

2. Targeted Killing 1274
   Al-Aulaqi v. Obama 1276

B. Congressional War-Making Authority and the “Long War” 1303
   Note: Competing Proposals for an AUMF Regarding the Islamic State 1311
   Obama Administration Proposed AUMF Against ISIL (2015) 1312
   Consolidated Authorization for Use of Military Force Resolution of 2017 1314

C. Foreign Intelligence Surveillance After 9/11 1318
   1. FISA After September 11 and the Wall of Separation Problem 1318
      a. Targeted Surveillance of Telephone and Internet Communications 1325
      b. Telephone Metadata 1327
      c. Internet Metadata 1328
   3. The FISC and Congressional Responses: The 702 Programs 1328
   4. The Administration’s Legal Defense for Ignoring FISA 1332
      Unclassified Report on the President’s Surveillance Program 1332
      Letter from William E. Moschella, Assistant Attorney General in charge of the Office of Legislative Affairs, U.S. Department of Justice, to Hon. Pat Roberts, Chairman, Senate Select Committee on Intelligence, et al. 1335
      January 9, 2006 Letter from Scholars and Former Government Officials to Congressional Leadership in Response to Justice Department Letter of December 22, 2005 1338
   5. Evaluating the Justice Department as Legal Advisor 1344
   6. Litigation and Accountability 1347
      Clapper v. Amnesty International USA 1348

Chapter 8 · Power and Institutional Design: The Case of the Presidency 1369

A. Presidential Elections 1370
   1. The Role of States in Presidential Selection 1370
      a. The Mechanics of the Electoral College: A Primer 1370
         1. The Constitutional Basics 1370
         2. The Statutory Framework 1371
3. The Nature of the Elector’s Office 1372
   b. The Merits of the Electoral College: A Debate 1373
      Direct Popular Election of the President and Vice President of
      the United States 1373
      J. A. Best, Prepared Statement on “The Case for the
      Electoral College” 1382

   Peter M. Shane, Disappearing Democracy: How Bush v. Gore
   Undermined the Federal Right to Vote for Presidential Electors 1392
   Bush v. Palm Beach County Canvassing Board 1398
   Bush v. Gore [I] 1404
   Bush v. Gore (II) 1407

B. Presidential and Vice-Presidential Succession 1445
   R. Celada, Presidential Continuity and Vice Presidential Vacancy Amendment 1446
   Note: Reagan-Bush Temporary Power Transfer 1451

C. Redesigning the President’s Political Role 1452
   1. Diagnosis One: Presidents Can Accomplish Too Little 1453
      Lloyd N. Cutler, To Form a Government 1453
   2. Diagnosis Two: “The Most Dangerous Branch” 1457
      Sanford Levinson and Jack M. Balkin, Constitutional Dictatorship: Its Dangers and Its Design 1458
   3. Diagnosis 3: The Patient Is Healthy 1464
   4. Diagnosis 4: Something Is Rotten . . . and Not in Denmark 1464
   5. A Model Redraft of Article II 1465
      Garrett Epps, The Ill-Made Prince: A Modest Proposal for a New Article II 1465

Appendix 1473
   Constitution of the United States 1473
   Authorization for the Use of Force (2001) 1489
   Proclamation of January 1, 1863 (Emancipation Proclamation) 1490
   Exec. Order No. 12866, Regulatory Planning and Review 1491

Index 1505